



Listening Sessions

Tribal Engagement and Indigenous-Led Public Health Disaster Research

<https://hazards.colorado.edu/research/public-health-disaster/listening-sessions>

Listening Session 3 Report: Research Gaps

June 20, 2023, 1:00 – 2:00 PM MDT

Notetakers and Report Authors: Shelby Ross and Melissa Villarreal

Report Reviewers: Musabber Ali Chisty, Brigid Mark, and Lori Peek

Audience for this Report: This report is prepared for the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention by the Hazards Center at the University of Colorado Boulder.

Report Outline:

- I. Listening Session 3 – Key Takeaway
- II. Listening Session 3 – Session Overview
- III. Appendix A: Listening Session 3 – Table of Registrants
- IV. Appendix B: Listening Session 3 – Zoom Session Participant List
- V. Appendix C: Listening Session 3 – Zoom Chat
- VI. Appendix D: Resources

I. Listening Session 3 – Key Takeaways:

During this third session, an important conversation emerged. Lessons we learned from the participants that could inform future research efforts, funding streams, or other activities included:

- Building trust within Indigenous communities as a researcher takes time and continuous efforts. A persistent presence within the community as a researcher is necessary. Researchers must also have knowledge of and understand cultural ideas of disasters in Indigenous communities.
- Understanding Indigenous methodologies within published literature is required, but it is also necessary for researchers to know what the **cultural protocols** are for the specific Indigenous community they are striving to help as not all Indigenous peoples and communities are the same.
- There is a will to collaborate amongst the participants, but an important question that arose out of our conversation is: how do we successfully implement research collaboration efforts between Indigenous and non-Indigenous professionals? Where are there documented cases—in the hazards and disaster field—of such collaborations?

There was a smaller group of participants when compared to the first two sessions. Nonetheless, some of the key lessons that we learned, as conveners, included:

- As facilitators, we need to be able to adapt to the audience in terms of size and composition. Because of the smaller audience size, we spent time during this session simply asking people to share more about why they decided to attend this session and what they were hoping to gain. This was instructive, and we plan to follow this format in future sessions so we can ensure we “know our audience” before diving straight into the session content.
- We anticipated more Indigenous community members and professionals to attend the listening sessions than we've had. Nonetheless, we have been fortunate enough to have at least 1-4 Indigenous professionals attend each session. With this in mind, we made sure to provide space for the Indigenous professionals to talk about the issues of their communities and the difficulties related to addressing such issues.

II. Listening Session 3 – Session Overview

Introduction to Session 3

76 people registered for (See **Appendix A** for full list of registrants) and 20 people attended and participated (See **Appendix B** for full list of participants) during the third listening session. This session was designed to understand the research gaps that exist within public health disaster research on issues impacting Indigenous communities. The discussion questions of this session were geared to better understand 1) *What are critical gaps in public health disaster research that we must fill to improve conditions for and capabilities of Indigenous communities?* and 2) *What research questions do we need to ask moving forward? What kinds of methodologies should researchers engage with to answer these questions?* Participants were encouraged to share their thoughts by unmuting and speaking or by typing in the Zoom chat (see **Appendix C** for chat transcript).

Group Discussions

Although we, as facilitators, had anticipated more Indigenous professionals to participate in the Listening Sessions series, this session was majority non-Indigenous researchers. The group found it difficult to answer the discussion questions as many were there with a desire to learn more Indigenous communities. Therefore, facilitation plans had to change. This change was also prompted during the session by Tracy Thomas (CDC). Tracy re-introduced the goals of the CDC to improve CDC's Public Health Emergency Preparedness and Response Capabilities Planning Model. Tracy shared more on the CDC's desire to be inclusive to Indigenous knowledge and Indigenous cultural perspectives that are currently missing from public health emergency preparedness. As such, Tracy was most interested in understanding if the functions of the model are applicable to Tribal communities, and if not, how the CDC can improve their capabilities to be more inclusive to Tribal communities.

Based on the lack of Indigenous community members and professionals in the meeting and with this additional context from Tracy, rather than proceeding with the planned discussion questions, the group decided it would be more helpful for the group to pause and for everyone to introduce themselves again. The goal of these re-introductions was so that everyone, including us as facilitators, could get a better sense of the participants' backgrounds, expertise, and whether they were Indigenous or not.

As a result, most of the discussion focused on how participants can be an ally to Indigenous research efforts within their field of study and how their expertise can help reduce the vulnerability of Indigenous communities. Majority of the participants expressed that they decided to attend the session to learn more about how they can create or improve spaces for Indigenous knowledge and Indigenous people within research and classrooms. Some participants were interested in teaching materials they could share with non-Indigenous students that would enlighten their perspectives of Indigenous peoples and Indigenous knowledge. There were resources shared via the Zoom chat in response (See **Appendix D**). There was also an interest in learning how current tools, from an engineering perspective, can be applied in a manner that will help reduce vulnerability in Indigenous communities.

The group also discussed what disaster means for Indigenous communities and what categorizes something as a “disaster” for Indigenous peoples who have the cultural belief/perspective that disasters are meant to happen if humans do not listen or observe the responses of natural processes that are reacting negatively to the destructive practices of humans. The Indigenous professionals who were in attendance during this session explained a universal teaching that is shared among Indigenous peoples to the group: “If you take care of the land, the land will take care of you.” It was also mentioned that there are some Indigenous communities who do not dare to even discuss disasters due to the cultural belief that a discussion around disasters will ultimately initiate a disaster event(s). As a result, many Tribes and Indigenous communities do not develop mitigation plans. The following question was raised by participants: how can researchers navigate around these cultural beliefs to still implement the pre-approved disaster plans that are required by the Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) to receive FEMA funding when a disaster occurs? A participant also raised the question of whether Indigenous people even have a word for “disaster” within their Native language, which could give insight into how Indigenous people have dealt with disaster events prior to colonization and how to navigate discussions around disaster planning for Indigenous communities.

This furthered discussions about cultural protocols in Indigenous research methodology, which include prioritizing the place or space of the Indigenous community and building relationships with Indigenous Elders, or the knowledge keepers. These cultural protocols are a necessary component for research that is conducted within Indigenous communities. Indigenous methodologies can be perceived as unconventional within established science protocols because it prioritizes direct contact with Elders, or knowledge keepers, and storytelling within the community rather than centering a random sampling technique. Nonetheless, Indigenous methodologies are necessary if researchers hope to understand Indigenous perspectives or knowledge. This led to a discussion around building trust with Indigenous communities as a non-Indigenous researcher. There is no consensus of what the timeline is for building that trust. Participants wondered if there was literature that described case studies of successful trust building between a non-Indigenous researcher and Indigenous communities.

Although Listening Session 3 did not cover the questions that we had planned for, the session did provide space to have necessary conversations that can help non-Indigenous professionals understand that building trust takes time. The lack of Indigenous peoples and Indigenous professionals in attendance at the Listening Sessions series shows that it does take time and continuous efforts to truly engage with Indigenous communities. This is due to the implications of historical trauma and research trauma. Indigenous people want to be the experts of their issues, but they also recognize that they cannot address these issues entirely alone. Two Indigenous professionals expressed how difficult it is for them to work alone on projects that have goals of addressing public health and/or disaster research. Participants agreed that the Listening Sessions series is a great start to building a community of Indigenous and non-Indigenous professionals who

hope to collaborate to address the status of Indigenous vulnerability in public health disaster research, but it is going to take more time to build trust amongst each other to truly reach that goal.

III. Appendix A: Listening Session 3 – Table of Registrants

Name	Email
Ranjan Datta	rdatta@mtroyal.ca
Rowena St. Pierre	Rowena.stpierre@gmail.com
Brenda Nowatak	kokhanoktrp@gmail.com
Nancy McPherson	nancy.m.mcpherson@hawaii.gov
Jennifer First	jfirst@utk.edu
Cynthia Sanders	CSanders@cmn.edu
Shinwoo Choi	shinwoo.choi11@gmail.com
Lucía Macías-Serrat	lucia0099@gmail.com
Catherine Welker	catherine.welker@fema.dhs.gov
Michael Sakosky	michael.sakosky@redcross.org
Shelby Ross	shelby.ross@colorado.edu
Melinda Villagran	mv12@txstate.edu
Anne Garland	awhgarland@yahoo.com
Sue Ann Sarpy	ssarpy@sarpyassoc.com
Maria Chelo De Venecia	MariaChelo.M.DeVenecia@hud.gov
Attah Benson	cerinitiative@gmail.com
Tracey Singh	tracey.singh-poole@mil.wa.gov
Edison Calderón	eacp2012@gmail.com

Keli M	keli@kelleynonprofitconsulting.com
Nnenia Campbell	nnenia@billandersonfund.org
Linda Frizzell	frizzell@paulbunyan.net
Sarah Michels	sarah.michels@mso.umt.edu
Kelsey West	kelsey.west@pgn.com
Silvana Croope	svcroope@ua.edu
Ines Siepmann	ines.siepmann@odhsoha.oregon.gov
Jennifer Eisele	jeisele@beyondtoxics.org
Anderson de Figueiredo	adefigue@uwyo.edu
Zhen Cong	zcong@uab.edu
Sydney Dyck	sdyck@udel.edu
Jolie Breeden	Jolie.breeden@colorado.edu
Hannah Hoffmann	hannah.hoffmann@redcross.org
Oral Saulters	osaulter@gmail.com
Traci Olson	onlygroomingkitties@gmail.com
Christine Benally	CHRISTINE.BENALLY@HHS.GOV
Marija Verner	marija.verner@yale.edu
Lauren Dent	ldent@usgs.gov
Deb Wetherill	deborah.wetherill@state.co.us
Jorge Lopez	jorge_lebeau@hotmail.com
Maureen Nso	maureenso24@gmail.com
Rob Long	rob.long@fema.dhs.gov

Katie Huang	katie.huang@disasterphilanthropy.org
Jennifer Denning	jennifer.l.denning@hecc.oregon.gov
Kerry Hoeschen	kerry.hoeschen@211info.org
Christinia Eala	christiniawin@yahoo.com
Rebecca Blackwood	rebeccablackwood75@gmail.com
Malini Roy	roy.malini91@gmail.com
Chevy Bullington-Condon	cbullington@spthb.org
Michelle Clark	mclark@spthb.org
Christine Gibb	cjibb2@uottawa.ca
Maki Koyama	maki.gifu@gmail.com
Grant Graves	grant.graves2@redcross.org
Cynthia Rose Harris	c4harris@yahoo.com
Waleska Sanabria León	waleska_sanabria@pucpr.edu
Christie Mazzeo-Pfoertner	christie.mazzeo-pfoertner@dos.ny.gov
Simplice Feikoumo	sfeikoumo@gmail.com
Logan Gerber-Chavez	lmgc@udel.edu
Chelsea LeNoble	Chelsea.lenoble@ucf.edu
Alain Philippe Binyet Bi Mbog	omepcpcameroon@gmail.com
Laura Olson	lauralynnolson@gmail.com
Heather Beffa	Heather@craftemergency.org
Consuelo Crow	consuelo.crow2@seattle.gov
Kelsey Nicholson	knicholson2@alaska.edu

Kathleen Moloney	kmoloney@uw.edu
Caitlin Langmead	clangmead@synergy-dr.com
Aubrey McAllister	amcallister@usgs.gov
Dayea Shim	dshim@hhf.com
Heather Champeau	hech2276@colorado.edu
Lisa Dobyms	ldobyms@nativepartnership.org
John Wiener	john.wiener@colorado.edu
Johanna Blake	jmtblake@usgs.gov
Mary Painter	mary.painter@colorado.edu
Jeffrey Gunderson	jeffrey.gunderson@gmail.com
Meghan Mordy	meghan.mordy@colorado.edu
Tracy Thomas	tct5@cdc.gov
Rachel Adams	Rachel.adams-1@colorado.edu
Jennifer Tobin	Jennifer.L.tobin@colorado.edu

IV. Appendix B: Listening Session 3 – Zoom Session Participant List

- | | |
|-------------------------------------|------------------------|
| 1. Melissa Villarreal (Facilitator) | 11. Silvana Croope |
| 2. Shelby Ross (Facilitator) | 12. Brenda Nowatak |
| 3. Lori Peek (PI) | 13. Chelsea LeNoble |
| 4. Nancy McPherson | 14. Lucia Macia-Serrat |
| 5. Jennifer Tobin | 15. Deb Wetherill |
| 6. Heather Champeau | 16. Edison Calderon |
| 7. Tracy Thomas | 17. Christine Gibb |
| 8. Nnena Campbell | 18. Michael Sakosky |
| 9. Mary Painter | 19. Rowena St. Pierre |
| 10. Anderson de Figueiredo | 20. Simplicie Feikoumo |

V. Appendix C: Listening Session 3 – Zoom Chat

14:00:49 From Lori Peek, Natural Hazards Center to Everyone:

Lori Peek, Boulder, Colorado!

14:00:53 From converge to Everyone:

Melissa Villarreal, Houston, Texas

14:00:59 From Shelby Ross to Everyone:

Shelby Ross, Rapid City, South Dakota

14:01:00 From Nnenia Campbell to Everyone:

Nnenia Campbell, Bellingham, Washington!

14:01:01 From Mary Painter to Everyone:

Mary Painter, St. Louis, MO 🍷

14:01:03 From Jennifer Tobin to Everyone:

Hi everyone! Jennifer Tobin, calling in from Fort Collins, Colorado.

14:01:16 From Chelsea LeNoble to Everyone:

Chelsea LeNoble, Sanford, Florida

14:01:18 From Heather Champeau to Everyone:

Heather Champeau, Arvada CO

14:01:28 From Lucía Macías-Serrat to Everyone:

Lucía Macías-Serrat from Mexico

14:03:31 From Simplicie Feikoumo to Everyone:

Hi everybody

From Simplicie Feikoumo, PhD

14:03:49 From Simplicie Feikoumo to Everyone:

France

14:05:12 From Lori Peek, Natural Hazards Center to Everyone:

The recordings from the prior two sessions are available here:

<https://hazards.colorado.edu/research/public-health-disaster/listening-sessions/schedule-registration>

14:05:36 From Nancy McPherson to Everyone:

Aloha kakou -- Nancy McPherson, Hunkpapha Lakota (SRST descended), serving Native Hawaiian communities in Hawai'i; Honolulu.

14:07:17 From converge to Everyone:

What are the critical gaps in public health disaster research that we must fill to improve conditions for and capabilities of Indigenous communities?

14:08:28 From Lori Peek, Natural Hazards Center to Everyone:

Public Health Emergency Preparedness Capabilities:

<https://www.cdc.gov/orr/readiness/capabilities/index.htm>

14:14:54 From Heather Champeau to Everyone:

Thank you so much for sharing!!!!

14:19:36 From Lori Peek, Natural Hazards Center to Everyone:

Here is a synopsis of Lucy's really important thesis research!

<https://hazards.colorado.edu/article/participation-please-barriers-to-tribal-mitigation-planning>

14:20:08 From Melissa Villarreal, CONVERGE (she/her) to Everyone:

What research questions do we need to ask moving forward? What kinds of methodologies should researchers engage with to answer these questions?

14:21:47 From Lori Peek, Natural Hazards Center to Melissa Villarreal, CONVERGE (she/her)(Direct Message):

That is a great point! I wonder if we could go around and do a quick round robin of why people are here!

14:22:47 From Melissa Villarreal, CONVERGE (she/her) to Everyone:

Yes, it's a small enough group, we can do that!

14:26:11 From Ines Siepmann to Everyone:

Hi all! Joining late, sorry - nice to meet you and happy to listen in.

14:27:02 From Lori Peek, Natural Hazards Center to Everyone:

Nancy that was very informative, and what a great reminder of how important it is to start from a position of cultural respect. Congratulations on this effort and good luck with these next 2 years!

14:28:09 From Lori Peek, Natural Hazards Center to Everyone:

Thank you, Nnenia, and thank you to the BAF for co-sponsoring these sessions!

<https://billandersonfund.org/>

14:29:53 From Lori Peek, Natural Hazards Center to Everyone:

Simplice - We couldn't hear you, so sorry! If you can introduce self and what brought you to the session that would be wonderful!

14:31:06 From Lori Peek, Natural Hazards Center to Everyone:

To Mary's great point, here is an important resource on the CARE Principles for Indigenous Data Governance: <https://www.gida-global.org/care>

14:31:17 From Mary Painter to Everyone:

Reacted to "To Mary's great poin..." with ❤️

14:31:53 From Nnenia Campbell to Everyone:

I very much look forward to catching up with the recording. Thank you for starting this important conversation!

14:31:56 From Lori Peek, Natural Hazards Center to Everyone:

Thank you for co-leading these sessions, Shelby! All, here is Shelby's bio!

<https://hazards.colorado.edu/biography/shelby-ross>

14:41:24 From Jennifer Tobin to Everyone:

Here is a resource that might be helpful for you, Christine:

<https://hazards.colorado.edu/about/partnerships/indigenous-sovereignty-in-emergency-response>

14:48:36 From Lori Peek, Natural Hazards Center to Everyone:

Thank you to Melissa for your co-leadership of these sessions! Melissa's bio!

<https://hazards.colorado.edu/biography/melissa-villarreal>

14:54:01 From Mary Painter to Everyone:

Trust building is such an important component - thank you for sharing, Shelby!

14:56:56 From Melissa Villarreal, CONVERGE (she/her) to Everyone:

That is a wonderful point. We can share those in our post-session report!

14:57:18 From Melissa Villarreal, CONVERGE (she/her) to Everyone:

*some of those. If you have any you want to share, please do so here or you can email us after at

melissa.villarreal@colorado.edu or shelby.ross@colorado.edu

14:58:21 From Nancy McPherson to Everyone:

<https://publicartarchive.org/art/Puino-Kolu-O-Hina--Three-Winds-of-Hina/20353283>

14:58:47 From Lori Peek, Natural Hazards Center to Everyone:

Thank you, Shelby and Melissa!!!

14:59:11 From Jennifer Tobin to Everyone:

Thank you everyone!

14:59:17 From Chelsea LeNoble to Everyone:

Thank you!

14:59:35 From Lori Peek, Natural Hazards Center to Everyone:

<https://hazards.colorado.edu/research/public-health-disaster/listening-sessions>

14:59:38 From Lucía Macías-Serrat to Everyone:

Thanks!

14:59:39 From Mary Painter to Everyone:

Thank you Melissa and Shelby!

14:59:48 From Deb Wetherill, CDPHE, OEPR to Everyone:

Thank you all!

14:59:55 From Melissa Villarreal, CONVERGE (she/her) to Everyone:

To register for the last virtual session and learn more about the in person session:

<https://hazards.colorado.edu/research/public-health-disaster/listening-sessions>

15:00:03 From Silvana Croope to Everyone:

Thanks

VI. Appendix D: Resources (Including Sessions 1, 2, and 3)

- Carter, L., and Peek, L. 2016. "[Participation Please: Barriers to Tribal Mitigation Planning.](#)" Natural Hazards Center.
- Dent, L.A., Donatuto, J., Campbell, L. et al. [Incorporating Indigenous voices in regional climate change adaptation: opportunities and challenges in the U.S. Pacific Northwest.](#) *Climatic Change* **176**, 27 (2023). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10584-023-03499-z>
- Kovach, M. (2021). *Indigenous Methodologies: characteristics, conversations, and contexts* (2nd ed.). Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- LeNoble, C., Naranjo, A., Shoss, M. et al. [Navigating a Context of Severe Uncertainty: The Effect of Industry Unsafety Signals on Employee Well-being During the COVID-19 Crisis.](#) *Occup Health Sci* (2023). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s41542-023-00155-x>
- Public Health Emergency Preparedness Capabilities: <https://www.cdc.gov/orr/readiness/capabilities/index.htm>
- <https://hazards.colorado.edu/about/partnerships/indigenous-sovereignty-in-emergency-response>

